

The Molecular Biology and Pathophysiology of Vascular Calcification

DOI: 10.3810/pgm.2014.03.2740

Mark F. McCarty, BA¹
James J. DiNicolantonio,
PharmD²

¹Catalytic Longevity, Carlsbad, CA;
²Mid America Heart Institute,
St. Luke's Hospital, Kansas City, MO;
Wegman's Pharmacy, Ithaca, NY

Abstract: Vascular calcification (VC), commonly encountered in renal failure, diabetes, and aging, is associated with a large increase in the risk for cardiovascular events and mortality. Calcification of the arterial media and of heart valves clearly plays a mediating role in this regard, whereas it is less clear how calcification of plaque influences atherogenesis and risk for plaque rupture. Vascular calcification is an active process in which vascular smooth muscle cells (VSMCs) adopt an osteoblastic phenotype and deposit hydroxyapatite crystals; apoptosis of VSMCs also promotes this deposition. Drivers of this phenotypic transition, which include elevated serum phosphate, advanced glycation end-products, bone morphogenetic proteins, inflammatory cytokines, and leptin, invariably induce oxidative stress in VSMCs, which appears to be a necessary and sufficient condition for induction of the runt-related transcription factor 2 gene (*RUNX2*) and the shift to osteoblastic behavior. Magnesium antagonizes the impact of phosphate on VSMC osteoblastic transition, both by a direct effect within VSMCs and by suppressing absorption of dietary phosphate. Antioxidants that suppress reduced nicotinamide adenine dinucleotide phosphate oxidase activity may have the potential to block the osteoblastic transition of VSMCs. Minimizing the absorption of dietary phosphate may also be helpful in this regard, particularly in renal failure, and it can be achieved with plant-based dietary choices, avoidance of phosphate additives, and administration of pharmaceutical phosphate binders, supplemental magnesium, and niacin. Good vitamin K status opposes VC by optimizing the γ -carboxylation of matrix Gla protein, a physiological antagonist of VC. Adequate but not excessive vitamin D status also appears to discourage VC. Etidronate, a structural analogue of pyrophosphate, has shown potential for blocking VC.

Keywords: vascular calcification; oxidative stress; phosphate; vitamin K

An Osteoblastic Phenotypic Shift

The phenomenon of vascular calcification (VC), which includes calcification of intimal atheromatous plaque, medial calcification (arteriosclerosis), and calcification of the aortic valve or mitral annulus, is a frequent consequence of chronic renal failure, diabetes, and aging, and has been linked epidemiologically with an increased risk for cardiovascular events and mortality, independent of traditional risk factors.¹⁻³ A meta-analysis found that individuals with calcification in any vascular wall, compared with those who have no calcification, were at a 3- to 4-fold greater risk for cardiovascular events and cardiovascular and all-cause mortality.³ Although VC can be serving as a marker for vascular inflammation and for the pathologies that provoke it, VC may also be pathogenic in its own right. The arterial stiffening associated with medial calcification promotes systolic hypertension, increased pulse pressure, and ventricular hypertrophy.⁴ Aortic stenosis reflecting calcification of the aortic valve is one of the most common cardiovascular disorders, placing a major load on the heart and often requiring surgical correction.⁵ Mitral annular calcification has been linked to

Correspondence: Mark F. McCarty, BA,
Catalytic Longevity,
7831 Rush Rose Drive, Apt 316,
Carlsbad, CA 92009.
Tel: 760-216-7272
Fax: 760-704-6379
E-mail: markfmccarty@gmail.com

an increased risk for atrial fibrillation and stroke, as well as increased cardiovascular mortality; the extent to which these associations are causal requires further clarification.⁶⁻⁹ The calcification of arterial plaque is associated with an increased risk for plaque rupture and myocardial infarction; whether the calcification per se promotes this outcome, or is rather just a marker for the inflammatory status of plaque, remains unclear. Plaques with a spotty pattern of calcification appear to be less stable than those with extensive calcification.¹⁰ It has been proposed that calcium phosphate crystals might destabilize plaque by promoting apoptosis in vascular smooth muscle cells (VSMCs) and inflammatory cytokine release by macrophages.¹¹

Although an increased calcium-phosphate product does tend to promote VC, it is now clear that this process is an active one in which vascular smooth muscle or other mesenchymal elements (such as pericytes)¹² of the vasculature undergo a phenotypic shift, such that their pattern of gene expression and behavior resembles that of osteoblasts.¹³ Induced expression of the runt-related transcription factor 2 (*RUNX2*; also called *cbf- α -1*) plays a key role in this regard, as this transcription factor boosts expression (directly or indirectly) of a number of other proteins found in osteoblasts—including the transcription factors osterix and *msh homeobox-2*, bone morphogenetic protein-2 and -4 (BMP-2 and BMP-4), alkaline phosphatase, osteopontin, osteocalcin, and matrix Gla protein (MGP)—that enable or regulate extracellular deposition of hydroxyapatite.¹⁴⁻¹⁹ Concurrently, certain proteins that function to inhibit extracellular calcification are downregulated.²⁰ Extracellular factors believed to play a physiological role in driving this phenotypic transition include: elevated serum phosphate, a major mediator of the VC commonly seen in chronic renal failure, but also linked to increased risk for VC in subjects with normal renal function²¹⁻²⁷; BMP-2 and BMP-4, members of the transforming growth factor family that contribute importantly to bone formation, but that also can be expressed in the vascular wall^{28,29}; advanced glycation end-products (AGEs) that are typically elevated in patients with diabetes³⁰⁻³³; other endogenous receptors for AGE ligands such as S100A12³⁴⁻³⁶; the uremic toxin indoxyl sulfate^{37,38}; and certain proinflammatory cytokines commonly expressed in inflamed atheromatous arteries, such as tumor necrosis factor- α and interleukin-6.³⁹⁻⁴² In addition to MGP, endogenous proteins that function to block VC include fetuin, osteopontin, and osteoprotegerin.^{43,44} Table 1 lists a number of agents that promote or inhibit the osteoblastic transition of VSMCs, or that work more directly to influence hydroxyapatite deposition.

Table 1. Promoters and Inhibitors of VC

Promoters	Inhibitors
Phosphate	Magnesium
High calcium X phosphate	Adiponectin
BMP-2/-4	Pyrophosphate
AGEs	Matrix Gla Protein
SAI0012	Fetuin-A
Indoxyl sulfate	Osteopontin
Tumor necrosis factor- α /interleukin-6	Osteoprotegerin
Leptin	

Abbreviations: AGE, advanced glycation end-product; BMP-2, bone morphogenetic protein-2; BMP-4, bone morphogenetic protein-4; VC, vascular calcification.

A number of recent epidemiological studies link insulin resistance, abdominal obesity, and metabolic syndrome to an increased risk for vascular and valvular calcification.⁴⁵⁻⁵³ Possible mediators of this effect include adiponectin and leptin, which are decreased and increased, respectively, in metabolic syndrome.⁵⁴ Low plasma adiponectin predicts progression of coronary calcification, independent of other established risk factors.⁵⁵ Moreover, vascular calcification is observed in adiponectin knockout mice.⁵⁶ Two studies have reported that adiponectin suppresses calcification in phosphate-treated VSMCs. One of these found that adiponectin decreased *RUNX2* expression and the osteoblastic transition,⁵⁶ and the other pointed to an anti-apoptotic role of adiponectin in tumor necrosis factor *TNF- α* -stimulated VSMCs as the basis for its anticalcifying effect.⁵⁷ These effects of adiponectin may be contingent on adenosine 5'-monophosphate-activated protein kinase activation.⁵⁷ Conversely, there are reports that leptin levels correlate with coronary calcification independently of other pertinent risk factors.^{58,59} In atherosclerosis-prone apolipoprotein E-deficient mice, daily leptin injections did not accelerate atherosclerosis per se, but markedly potentiated vascular and valvular calcification.⁶⁰ In addition, in vitro, leptin has been shown to promote an osteoblastic phenotype in VSMCs.^{61,62} Hence, adiponectin and leptin appear to have a yin-yang relationship with respect to vascular calcification. The possibility that pharmaceutical adenosine 5'-monophosphate-activated protein kinase activators might mimic the protective impact of adiponectin is suggested by a controlled 1-year study in which metformin therapy slowed progression of coronary artery calcification in human immunodeficiency virus-infected patients with metabolic syndrome.⁶³

Oxidative Stress

Virtually every physiological agent known to provoke an osteoblastic phenotypic shift in VSMCs has been shown to induce oxidative stress in these cells; moreover, this oxidative

stress appears to drive the phenotypic transition, because measures that prevent or control this stress have been found to block this transition. Exposure of cultured VSMCs to adequate levels of hydrogen peroxide induces RUNX2 and promotes the osteoblastic transition, suggesting that induction of oxidative stress in smooth muscle is both a necessary and sufficient condition for this transition.^{17,64} Consistent with this view, markers of oxidative stress are found in the vicinity of calcifying foci in arterial walls and stenotic aortic valves.^{65–67} Hydrogen peroxide, rather than other radical intermediates such as superoxide, peroxynitrite, or hydroxyl radical, appears to be the mediating factor in this regard; hence, modulation of the redox status of sulfhydryl groups seems likely to be responsible for the impact of oxidative stress on the phenotypic transition.⁶⁶ Increased production (or diminished catabolism) of hydrogen peroxide promotes activation of nuclear factor κ B, Akt phosphorylation, and induction of endoplasmic reticulum stress—factors that collaborate to promote the transcription and protein expression of RUNX2, while working in other ways to downregulate factors that oppose ectopic calcification.^{17,29} For example, nuclear factor κ B suppresses the expression of ankylosis protein homologue, a transmembrane protein that enables extracellular export of pyrophosphate, an antagonist of hydroxyapatite deposition.^{20,68}

The primary source of the oxidative stress that drives the osteoblastic transition varies according to the stimulus. Most such stimuli, including BMP-2, AGEs, SA100A12, indoxyl sulfate, inflammatory cytokines, and leptin, have been shown to activate reduced nicotinamide adenine dinucleotide phosphate (NADPH) oxidase complexes in vascular smooth muscle.^{29,33–35,38,42,69,70} Adiponectin appears to have the opposite effect.⁷¹ These findings correlate nicely with a recent report that serum levels of free bilirubin—a compound now known to function intracellularly as a potent inhibitor of NADPH oxidase activity^{72–75}—correlate inversely with the risk for vascular calcification.⁷⁶ Moreover, induction of heme oxygenase-1, an enzyme that generates bilirubin (via biliverdin and biliverdin reductase) from heme, has been shown to block osteoblastic maturation in primary cultured osteoblasts.⁷⁷ Conversely, the heme oxygenase-1 activity of calcifying arteries was found to be depressed in rats treated with toxic doses of vitamin D.⁷⁸

Not surprisingly, there are reports that smokers are at greater risk for VC.^{79–81} Although there do not appear to be any studies that have examined the impact of smoke extract on osteoblastic transition in VSMCs, the $\alpha\beta$ -unsaturated aldehydes and ketones that are prominent constituents of

tobacco smoke have been shown to activate NADPH oxidase in a range of tissues by stimulating protein kinase C activity.^{82–87} Exposure of rats to cigarette smoke boosts oxidative stress in VSMCs and endothelial cells of their carotid arteries; exposure of carotid arteries to cigarette smoke extract *ex vivo* has a similar effect.⁸³ The carotid oxidative stress in rats exposed to cigarette smoke was inhibited *ex vivo* by diphenyleneiodonium, an inhibitor of NADPH oxidase. Nicotine did not influence arterial oxidative stress in this model. It appears likely that the adverse vascular effects of smoking, including VC, are largely mediated by NADPH oxidase activation.

Concentrations of phosphate comparable to those typically seen in renal failure patients (eg, 2.0–2.6 mM) drive the osteoblastic transition of VSMCs *in vitro*.^{21,22} Intracellular uptake of phosphate via the Pit-1 membrane transporter is necessary for this effect, so an increase in intracellular free phosphate presumably mediates it.^{21,88,89} There is recent evidence that exposure of VSMCs to elevated phosphate increases mitochondrial membrane potential while boosting mitochondrial superoxide generation, and that the respiratory chain inhibitor rotenone, but not inhibitors of NADPH oxidase, suppresses the subsequent osteoblastic transition.⁹⁰ This finding is at variance with those of a previous study, in which activation of NADPH was found to be at least partially responsible for the phenotypic transition evoked by elevated phosphate.⁹¹ The authors of the more recent study note that they employed primary cells from a bovine artery, whereas the previous study had used an immortalized smooth muscle cell-derived line (A7r5) that was likely to have higher expression of NADPH oxidase and lower mitochondrial activity. Conceivably, activation of NADPH oxidase in the earlier study might have been a downstream consequence of increased mitochondrial superoxide production.

An even more recent study confirms that elevated phosphate exposure promotes oxidant stress in mitochondria, but in this study mitochondrial membrane potential was decreased, and markers of apoptosis were upregulated.⁹² Arguably, this may reflect a more intense induction of mitochondrial oxidative stress that damages the mitochondrial inner membrane, leading to a collapse of membrane potential and induction of apoptosis. Indeed, apoptosis of VSMCs is a typical feature of VC, and is suspected to expedite it by promoting nucleation of hydroxyapatite.^{13,93}

The possibility that superoxide derived from uncoupled nitric oxide synthase (NOS) contributes to calcification of the aortic valve has been suggested by a study that demonstrated increased superoxide production in stenotic aortic valves

acquired during surgery or on autopsy.⁶⁷ Whereas NADPH oxidase activity was not found to be increased in these valves, inhibitors of NOS suppressed this oxidative stress.

Magnesium

Extracellular magnesium in high physiological concentrations has been shown to block the ability of elevated phosphate to promote an osteoblastic transition in VSMCs; this effect is contingent on intracellular uptake of the magnesium.^{94,95} These findings fit nicely with evidence that serum magnesium correlates negatively with the risk for VC and mortality in hemodialysis patients, and a clinical trial observed that supplemental magnesium reduces carotid intima-media thickness in such patients.⁹⁶⁻⁹⁹ Whether magnesium blocks the impact of elevated phosphate on oxidative stress in VSMCs has not yet been reported, but it can be credibly hypothesized that an increase in intracellular magnesium somehow blunts the pro-oxidative impact of elevated intracellular phosphate on mitochondrial function, possibly via a direct ionic interaction. If this hypothesis is correct, it is conceivable that the protective impact of magnesium on risk for VC is specific to ameliorating the adverse effects of elevated phosphate in this regard, and that VC stemming from other stimuli (such as increased AGEs in patients with diabetes) might not be influenced by magnesium. Further cell culture studies should clarify these issues.

Antioxidant Strategies

The accumulating evidence that hydrogen peroxide is the key driver of osteoblastic transition in VSMCs suggests that antioxidant measures capable of suppressing the production of hydrogen peroxide, hastening its catabolism, or antagonizing its oxidative impact on protein structure could be useful for controlling VC. In light of the ability of bilirubin to inhibit the activity of certain isoforms of NADPH oxidase (the isoform specificity of this effect still awaits clarification), it is interesting to note that the *Spirulina* chromophore phycocyanobilin (PhyCB), a biliverdin derivative converted by biliverdin reductase activity to the bilirubin homologue phycocyanorubin within cells, has recently been shown to mimic the NADPH oxidase-inhibitor effect of bilirubin, both in vitro and in vivo.^{100,101} This phenomenon likely accounts for the versatile anti-inflammatory and antioxidant effects of oral phycocyanin (the *Spirulina* protein to which PhyCB is covalently attached) observed in a plethora of rodent studies.¹⁰¹⁻¹⁰³ Because there is good reason to suspect that bilirubin may inhibit VC in humans, the impact of oral phycocyanin in rodent models of VC, and of biliverdin and PhyCB in cell

culture models of this phenomenon, should be evaluated. It should be noted, however, that PhyCB (or bilirubin) would not be expected to impact the mitochondrial oxidative stress induced directly by increased intracellular phosphate. And whether humans absorb and metabolize PhyCB in a manner comparable to rodents remains to be established.

Intracellular glutathione functions to reverse the oxidations of sulfhydryl groups induced by hydrogen peroxide, and supplementation with the nutraceutical *N*-acetylcysteine can boost intracellular glutathione by increasing the availability of its rate-limiting precursor cysteine.^{104,105} This may explain the favorable impact of *N*-acetylcysteine (600 mg twice daily) in a 2-year placebo-controlled trial in hemodialysis patients; the treated patients were 40% less likely to experience a cardiac event during the study (relative risk, 0.60; 95% CI, 0.38-0.95; $P = 0.03$).¹⁰⁶ This study was published over a decade ago, and no attempts to confirm it have appeared yet.

Phase 2 inducers can also boost intracellular glutathione levels (via induction of γ -glutamylcysteine synthase), as well as the activities of various antioxidant enzymes. Lipoic acid has phase 2 inducing potential, and is also suspected of functioning more directly as an antioxidant within mitochondria.¹⁰⁷⁻¹¹¹ Lipoic acid has been reported to suppress the osteoblastic transition of VSMCs exposed to elevated phosphate, and when administered orally suppressed VC in mice treated with toxic doses of vitamin D.⁹² Conceivably, other phase 2 inducing compounds such as sulforaphane or green tea catechins could provide analogous protection.¹¹²

Selenium is an essential cofactor for various forms of the enzyme glutathione peroxidase, some of which catabolize hydrogen peroxide. Nutritional selenium availability can be rate-limiting for the expression of selenium-dependent enzymes in regions where soil selenium availability is low, and selenium availability is also suboptimal in many cell culture media.^{113,114} This likely explains why preincubation with selenite was found to suppress the osteoblastic transition in VSMCs exposed to hydrogen peroxide in vitro.⁶⁴ An improvement in selenium status might be helpful for the control of VC in regions where nutritional selenium intakes tend to be low.

Whether certain antioxidants might have some utility for antagonizing the upregulatory impact of increased intracellular phosphate on mitochondrial superoxide generation remains to be seen. Mitochondrial oxidative stress can exert a feed-forward effect on mitochondrial superoxide production by damaging the respiratory chain of the mitochondrial inner membrane.¹¹⁵ Indeed, the potent membrane antioxidant astaxanthin has been found to be protective in

ischemia-reperfusion models.^{116–118} Whether preincubation with astaxanthin could influence the impact of elevated phosphorus on osteoblastic transition and apoptosis in VSMCs has yet to be determined.

To the extent that uncoupled NOS might contribute to the oxidative stress that drives valvular stenosis, it should be noted that high-dose folate has been shown to promote recoupling of this enzyme, presumably by preventing or reversing the oxidation of the NOS cofactor tetrahydrobiopterin by peroxynitrite-derived oxidants.^{119–124} This effect is mediated by high intracellular levels of reduced folate metabolites, which have high and versatile oxidant scavenging activity.¹²⁰ This is entirely unrelated to modulation of homocysteine metabolism, and requires higher doses of folic acid than those that optimally suppress homocysteine.¹²⁵ Several decades ago, Kurt Oster pioneered the use of high-dose folate (40–80 mg daily) in cardiovascular medicine; his enthusiastic reports were ignored, as they were only anecdotal.¹²⁶

These considerations suggest that certain antioxidants might have the potential to control VC. Nonetheless, these possibilities are currently undocumented and hypothetical from a clinical standpoint and should not be used as a guide to current therapy. At present, evaluation of certain antioxidants in cell culture studies and rodent models of VC would be warranted; clinical trials could then be attempted if these efforts yielded encouraging results. Skepticism regarding the clinical utility of antioxidants is understandable given the null or negative outcomes observed in some major clinical trials involving agents such as α -tocopherol, vitamin C, and β -carotene.¹²⁷ However, it should be noted that these compounds would be expected to do little or nothing to block the production or cell signaling impact of hydrogen peroxide, which is why they were not mentioned in the foregoing discussion.

Minimizing Phosphate Absorption

A range of additional measures may be helpful in the prevention of VC. Magnesium supplementation has been cited above; this might work not only via a direct effect of elevated magnesium on VSMCs, but also by promoting precipitation of dietary phosphate in the gastrointestinal tract, opposing its absorption.^{128,129} Moreover, a number of practical measures have the potential to moderate serum phosphate levels by minimizing the amount of phosphate absorbed from the diet: choosing a plant-based diet, in which a high proportion of the phosphate is tied up in poorly absorbable phytates; avoiding soft drinks and processed foods that contain phosphate additives; employing phosphate-binding drugs such as

sevelamer or lanthanum carbonate, as is commonly done in treatment of chronic renal disease; magnesium supplementation; and treatment with sustained-release niacin, which appears to decrease gastrointestinal expression of a prominent phosphate transport protein.^{128–140}

Vitamin K and Vitamin D

Vitamin K can favorably influence VC, as posttranslational γ -carboxylation of MGP, catalyzed by a vitamin K–dependent enzyme, is crucial to MGP’s ability to antagonize VC.^{141,142} This presumably explains why use of the vitamin K–antagonist drug warfarin is associated with increased risk for VC.¹⁴³ How properly carboxylated MGP functions in this regard is still unclear; it can bind to and antagonize the activity of the BMP proteins, which may play a prominent role in VC, but additional mechanisms are being explored.^{144–146} Serum levels of dephospho-undercarboxylated MGP have been found to correlate directly with VC, and these levels can be decreased dose-dependently by effective vitamin K supplementation.^{147–150} The menaquinone form of vitamin K (vitamin K₂) produced by certain bacteria appears to be more effective for promoting carboxylation of MGP than the phyloquinone form found in green leafy vegetables and algae, presumably because the former is more effectively transported to peripheral tissues (as opposed to the liver).¹⁵¹ In epidemiological studies, increased intakes of menaquinone, but not phyloquinone, have been linked to a lower risk for coronary calcification and coronary heart disease.^{152–154} But significant amounts of vitamin K₂ are found only in certain fermented soy products (notably natto) and certain cheeses. Hence, aside from aficionados of natto (which is popular in eastern Japan),¹⁵⁵ the vitamin K activity of most people eating natural diets is suboptimal from the standpoint of MGP γ -carboxylation and, presumably, from the standpoint of VC. Supplemental intakes ≥ 200 μ g menaquinone-7 daily appear to achieve near maximal γ -carboxylation of MGP and other vitamin K–dependent proteins.¹⁵¹ Although the highly favorable impact of vitamin K₂ supplementation on bone strength and fracture risk has been documented (reflecting vitamin K’s role in γ -carboxylation of osteocalcin),¹⁵⁶ its impact on risk for VC should be addressed in future studies. Importantly, vitamin K status tends to be poor in hemodialysis patients, who of course are at high risk for VC.^{157,158}

Poor vitamin D status (low serum 25-hydroxyvitamin D) has been associated clinically with increased VC, whether or not renal function is impaired, and such calcification is seen in mice fed a vitamin D–deficient diet.^{159–163} On the other hand, toxic intakes of vitamin D promote VC by increasing serum

levels of unbound calcitriol, which functions to boost absorption of both calcium and phosphate.^{164,165} Why moderate vitamin D activity is protective with respect to VC remains unexplained. Although the cardiovascular protection afforded by good vitamin D status is likely mediated in large part by downregulation of parathyroid hormone (PTH) levels,^{166,167} PTH has not been found to promote osteoblastic transition in smooth muscle cell cultures; indeed, stimulation of the membrane PTH receptor on VSMCs has been reported to suppress this transition.^{168,169} On the other hand, continuous intravenous infusion of PTH was found to promote VC and RUNX2 expression in parathyroidectomized, 5/6 nephrectomized rats, so it is conceivable that PTH promotes VC through some indirect mechanism.¹⁷⁰ Another possibility is that vitamin D directly influences vascular smooth muscle function, as the 1- α -hydroxylase activity required for conversion of 25-hydroxyvitamin D to the active hormone calcitriol has been reported to be present in cultured VSMCs.¹⁷¹ Although a recent report indicates that calcitriol and other vitamin D receptor agonists can inhibit the osteoblastic transition in VSMCs *in vitro*,¹⁷² previous reports indicated either no effect or an adverse effect in this regard.^{173–175} It is not yet clear whether autocrine production of calcitriol in vascular smooth muscle is high enough to be of physiological significance *in vivo*. Vitamin D supplementation, in daily doses within the range of 2000 to 10 000 International Units, appears to be an appropriate and safe strategy for ensuring replete vitamin D status.¹⁷⁶

In renal failure patients, the capacity to convert 25-hydroxyvitamin D to calcitriol is typically impaired (though usually not absent),^{177,178} so treatment with vitamin D agonist drugs, not requiring 1- α -hydroxylase activation for activity, is commonly employed. These agents are a mixed blessing, as they have the potential to promote VC by expedited absorption of both calcium and phosphate; hence, relatively low doses of these agents may provide the greatest net benefit for vascular health. Paricalcitol, which appears less likely than certain other vitamin D agonist drugs to promote excessive calcium/phosphate absorption, may have a more favorable effect than calcitriol on phosphate-stimulated osteoblastic transition *in vitro*.^{179,180}

Etidronate

As noted, one strategy that VSMCs employ to prevent ectopic calcification is to generate pyrophosphate within the extracellular matrix, either by ectonucleotide pyrophosphatase activity or by exporting pyrophosphate via the ankylosis protein homologue transporter.⁶⁸ Pyrophosphate not only antagonizes

hydroxyapatite deposition by a direct biophysical effect, but also acts on VSMCs to prevent an osteoblastic phenotypic shift.¹⁸¹ (Conversely, alkaline phosphatase degrades the extracellular pyrophosphate pool, thus accounting for its key role in bone formation and VC.) The bisphosphonate drug etidronate is a highly stable analogue of pyrophosphate that shares its ability to block hydroxyapatite deposition. Two small controlled clinical trials have evaluated the impact of intermittent etidronate on VC in hemodialysis patients with favorable results. A regimen of 200 mg/day for 14 days every 3 months led to a reduction in coronary artery calcification that was significant relative to controls; bone density was not changed.¹⁸² (A similar regimen in patients with type 2 diabetes was reported to decrease carotid intima-media thickness).¹⁸³ Another controlled study evaluated 200 mg etidronate given every day of dialysis; the aortic calcification area failed to progress under this treatment, whereas it continued to increase in the control group; again, bone density was not influenced in the treated group.¹⁸⁴ In a rat model of renal failure and VC, etidronate administration likewise inhibited aortic calcification without modifying bone density.¹⁸⁵ These results suggest that intermittent etidronate merits more extensive evaluation in groups at high risk for VC.

Conclusion: Practical Strategies for Avoiding VC

There is considerable evidence that induced oxidative stress—stemming from NADPH oxidase, mitochondria, and possibly uncoupled NOS—drives the osteoblastic phenotypic transition of VSMCs that mediates vascular and valvular calcification. Therefore, drugs and nutraceuticals that either inhibit the production of hydrogen peroxide or oppose its impact on cellular signaling in VSMCs may have the potential to prevent VCs; they may include the bilirubin analogue phycocyanobilin, as well as *N*-acetylcysteine, lipoic acid, high-dose folate, and selenium. Elevated phosphate levels trigger mitochondrial oxidative stress in VSMCs. Measures that decrease vascular exposure to phosphate have been shown to be useful for controlling VC, especially in those with compromised renal function; a plant-based diet, avoidance of phosphate additives, pharmaceutical phosphate binders (sevelamer, lanthanum carbonate), supplemental magnesium, and niacin may be useful in this regard. Magnesium acts on VSMCs directly to counteract the impact of phosphate on osteoblastic transition. Optimizing vitamin K status, preferably via supplementation with menaquinone-7, helps to prevent VC by promoting sufficient γ -carboxylation of the calcification

Table 2. Strategies for Inhibiting VC

Reducing phosphate absorption—for moderating serum phosphate
Plant-based diet
Avoidance of phosphate additives
Pharmaceutical phosphate binders or magnesium
Niacin
Antioxidants—potentially useful for inhibiting osteoblastic transition of VSMCs
Phycocyanobilin, N-acetylcysteine, lipoic acid
Magnesium—suppresses phosphate-driven osteoblastic transition of VSMCs
Vitamin K—promotes γ -carboxylation of MGP
Vitamin D—protective when adequate but not toxic; mechanism unclear
Etidronate—pharmaceutical pyrophosphate mimic
Correct/control metabolic syndrome and diabetes
Smoking cessation

Abbreviations: MGP, matrix Gla protein; VC, vascular calcification; VSMC, vascular smooth muscle cell.

antagonist MGP. Maintaining replete vitamin D status may also provide protection from VC, for reasons that are unclear, whereas vitamin D toxicity promotes VC by boosting calcium and phosphate absorption inappropriately. Prevention or control of metabolic syndrome and diabetes with prudent lifestyle measures, as well as the avoidance of tobacco, also appears likely to diminish the risk for VC. Etidronate may have potential for inhibiting VC by mimicking the protective impact of pyrophosphate in this regard. These strategies are summarized in Table 2.

Conflict of Interest Statement

Mark F. McCarty, BA, is a coinventor of the nutraceutical use of phycocyanobilin oligopeptides extracted from *Spirulina*, for which a patent is pending. Mr McCarty also serves on the advisory committee and is a stockholder of NutriGuard Research, Inc.; he is a consultant for Whitaker Wellness Institute and Oasis of Hope Hospital; and he is a research fellow for Catalytic Longevity. James J. DiNicolantonio, PharmD, has no conflicts of interest to declare.

References

- Thompson GR, Partridge J. Coronary calcification score: the coronary-risk impact factor. *Lancet*. 2004;363(9408):557–559.
- Detrano R, Guerci AD, Carr JJ, et al. Coronary calcium as a predictor of coronary events in four racial or ethnic groups. *N Engl J Med*. 2008;358(13):1336–1345.
- Rennenberg RJ, Kessels AG, Schurgers LJ, van Engelshoven JM, de Leeuw PW, Kroon AA. Vascular calcifications as a marker of increased cardiovascular risk: a meta-analysis. *Vasc Health Risk Manag*. 2009;5(1):185–197.
- Ferro CJ, Chue CD, Steeds RP, Townend JN. Is lowering phosphate exposure the key to preventing arterial stiffening with age? *Heart*. 2009;95(21):1770–1772.
- Lindroos M, Kupari M, Heikkilä J, Tilvis R. Prevalence of aortic valve abnormalities in the elderly: an echocardiographic study of a random population sample. *J Am Coll Cardiol*. 1993;21(5):1220–1225.
- Fox CS, Vasani RS, Parise H, et al. Mitral annular calcification predicts cardiovascular morbidity and mortality: the Framingham Heart Study. *Circulation*. 2003;107(11):1492–1496.
- Fox CS, Parise H, Vasani RS, et al. Mitral annular calcification is a predictor for incident atrial fibrillation. *Atherosclerosis*. 2004;173(2):291–294.
- Potpara TS, Vasiljevic ZM, Vujisic-Tesic BD, et al. Mitral annular calcification predicts cardiovascular morbidity and mortality in middle-aged patients with atrial fibrillation: the Belgrade Atrial Fibrillation Study. *Chest*. 2011;140(4):902–910.
- De Marco M, Gerds E, Casalnuovo G, et al. Mitral annular calcification and incident ischemic stroke in treated hypertensive patients: the LIFE study. *Am J Hypertens*. 2013;26(4):567–573.
- Ehara S, Kobayashi Y, Yoshiyama M, et al. Spotty calcification typifies the culprit plaque in patients with acute myocardial infarction: an intravascular ultrasound study. *Circulation*. 2004;110(22):3424–3429.
- Ewence AE, Bootman M, Roderick HL, et al. Calcium phosphate crystals induce cell death in human vascular smooth muscle cells: a potential mechanism in atherosclerotic plaque destabilization. *Circ Res*. 2008;103(5):e28–e34.
- Doherty MJ, Ashton BA, Walsh S, Beresford JN, Grant ME, Canfield AE. Vascular pericytes express osteogenic potential in vitro and in vivo. *J Bone Miner Res*. 1998;13(5):828–838.
- Giachelli CM. Vascular calcification mechanisms. *J Am Soc Nephrol*. 2004;15(12):2959–2964.
- Ducy P, Zhang R, Geoffroy V, Ridall AL, Karsenty G. Osf2/Cbfa1: a transcriptional activator of osteoblast differentiation. *Cell*. 1997;89(5):747–754.
- Speer MY, Li X, Hiremath PG, Giachelli CM. Runx2/Cbfa1, but not loss of myocardin, is required for smooth muscle cell lineage reprogramming toward osteochondrogenesis. *J Cell Biochem*. 2010;110(4):935–947.
- Chen NX, Duan D, O'Neill KD, et al. The mechanisms of uremic serum-induced expression of bone matrix proteins in bovine vascular smooth muscle cells. *Kidney Int*. 2006;70(6):1046–1053.
- Byon CH, Javed A, Dai Q, et al. Oxidative stress induces vascular calcification through modulation of the osteogenic transcription factor Runx2 by AKT signaling. *J Biol Chem*. 2008;283(22):15319–15327.
- Xiao G, Jiang D, Ge C, et al. Cooperative interactions between activating transcription factor 4 and Runx2/Cbfa1 stimulate osteoblast-specific osteocalcin gene expression. *J Biol Chem*. 2005;280(35):30689–30696.
- Liu TM, Lee EH. Transcriptional regulatory cascades in Runx2-dependent bone development. *Tissue Eng Part B Rev*. 2013;19(3):254–263.
- Zhao G, Xu MJ, Zhao MM, et al. Activation of nuclear factor-kappa B accelerates vascular calcification by inhibiting ankylosin protein homolog expression. *Kidney Int*. 2012;82(1):34–44.
- Jono S, McKee MD, Murry CE, et al. Phosphate regulation of vascular smooth muscle cell calcification. *Circ Res*. 2000;87(7):E10–E17.
- Giachelli CM. The emerging role of phosphate in vascular calcification. *Kidney Int*. 2009;75(9):890–897.
- Linefsky JP, O'Brien KD, Katz R, et al. Association of serum phosphate levels with aortic valve sclerosis and annular calcification: the cardiovascular health study. *J Am Coll Cardiol*. 2011;58(3):291–297.
- Adeney KL, Siscovick DS, Ix JH, et al. Association of serum phosphate with vascular and valvular calcification in moderate CKD. *J Am Soc Nephrol*. 2009;20(2):381–387.
- Gutierrez OM. Increased serum phosphate and adverse clinical outcomes: unraveling mechanisms of disease. *Curr Opin Nephrol Hypertens*. 2011;20(3):224–228.
- Cancela AL, Santos RD, Titan SM, et al. Phosphorus is associated with coronary artery disease in patients with preserved renal function. *PLoS ONE*. 2012;7(5):e36883.

27. Figueiredo CP, Rajamannan NM, Lopes JB, et al. Serum phosphate and hip bone mineral density as additional factors for high vascular calcification scores in a community-dwelling: the Sao Paulo Ageing and Health Study (SPAH). *Bone*. 2013;52(1):354–359.
28. Hruska KA, Mathew S, Saab G. Bone morphogenetic proteins in vascular calcification. *Circ Res*. 2005;97(2):105–114.
29. Liberman M, Johnson RC, Handy DE, Loscalzo J, Leopold JA. Bone morphogenetic protein-2 activates NADPH oxidase to increase endoplasmic reticulum stress and human coronary artery smooth muscle cell calcification. *Biochem Biophys Res Commun*. 2011;413(3):436–441.
30. Ren X, Shao H, Wei Q, Sun Z, Liu N. Advanced glycation end-products enhance calcification in vascular smooth muscle cells. *J Int Med Res*. 2009;37(3):847–854.
31. Suga T, Iso T, Shimizu T, et al. Activation of receptor for advanced glycation end products induces osteogenic differentiation of vascular smooth muscle cells. *J Atheroscler Thromb*. 2011;18(8):670–683.
32. Wang Z, Jiang Y, Liu N, et al. Advanced glycation end-product Nepsilon-carboxymethyl-Lysine accelerates progression of atherosclerotic calcification in diabetes. *Atherosclerosis*. 2012;221(2):387–396.
33. Wei Q, Ren X, Jiang Y, Jin H, Liu N, Li J. Advanced glycation end products accelerate rat vascular calcification through RAGE/oxidative stress. *BMC Cardiovasc Disord*. 2013;13:13.
34. Hofmann Bowman MA, Gawdzik J, Bukhari U, et al. S100A12 in vascular smooth muscle accelerates vascular calcification in apolipoprotein E-null mice by activating an osteogenic gene regulatory program. *Arterioscler Thromb Vasc Biol*. 2011;31(2):337–344.
35. Gawdzik J, Mathew L, Kim G, Puri TS, Hofmann Bowman MA. Vascular remodeling and arterial calcification are directly mediated by S100A12 (EN-RAGE) in chronic kidney disease. *Am J Nephrol*. 2011;33(3):250–259.
36. Towler DA. Vascular calcification: it's all the RAGE! *Arterioscler Thromb Vasc Biol*. 2011;31(2):237–239.
37. Adijiang A, Goto S, Uramoto S, Nishijima F, Niwa T. Indoxyl sulphate promotes aortic calcification with expression of osteoblast-specific proteins in hypertensive rats. *Nephrol Dial Transplant*. 2008;23(6):1892–1901.
38. Muteliefu G, Enomoto A, Jiang P, Takahashi M, Niwa T. Indoxyl sulphate induces oxidative stress and the expression of osteoblast-specific proteins in vascular smooth muscle cells. *Nephrol Dial Transplant*. 2009;24(7):2051–2058.
39. Al-Aly Z. Arterial calcification: a tumor necrosis factor-alpha mediated vascular Wnt-opathy. *Transl Res*. 2008;151(5):233–239.
40. Lee HL, Woo KM, Ryoo HM, Baek JH. Tumor necrosis factor-alpha increases alkaline phosphatase expression in vascular smooth muscle cells via MSX2 induction. *Biochem Biophys Res Commun*. 2010;391(1):1087–1092.
41. Lencel P, Delplace S, Pilet P, et al. Cell-specific effects of TNF-alpha and IL-1beta on alkaline phosphatase: implication for syndesmophyte formation and vascular calcification. *Lab Invest*. 2011;91(10):1434–1442.
42. Lai CF, Shao JS, Behrmann A, Krchma K, Cheng SL, Towler DA. TNFR1-activated reactive oxidative species signals up-regulate osteogenic Msx2 programs in aortic myofibroblasts. *Endocrinology*. 2012;153(8):3897–3910.
43. Johnson RC, Leopold JA, Loscalzo J. Vascular calcification: pathobiological mechanisms and clinical implications. *Circ Res*. 2006;99(10):1044–1059.
44. Weissen-Plenz G, Nitschke Y, Rutsch F. Mechanisms of arterial calcification: spotlight on the inhibitors. *Adv Clin Chem*. 2008;46:263–293.
45. Briand M, Lemieux I, Dumesnil JG, et al. Metabolic syndrome negatively influences disease progression and prognosis in aortic stenosis. *J Am Coll Cardiol*. 2006;47(11):2229–2236.
46. Katz R, Budoff MJ, Takasu J, et al. Relationship of metabolic syndrome with incident aortic valve calcium and aortic valve calcium progression: the Multi-Ethnic Study of Atherosclerosis (MESA). *Diabetes*. 2009;58(4):813–819.
47. Talbott EO, Zborowski JV, Rager JR, Boudreaux MY, Edmundowicz DA, Guzick DS. Evidence for an association between metabolic cardiovascular syndrome and coronary and aortic calcification among women with polycystic ovary syndrome. *J Clin Endocrinol Metab*. 2004;89(11):5454–5461.
48. Ibebuogu UN, Ahmadi N, Hajsadeghi F, et al. Measures of coronary artery calcification and association with the metabolic syndrome and diabetes. *J Cardiometab Syndr*. 2009;4(1):6–11.
49. Narla V, Santos RD, Campbell CY, et al. Coronary artery calcification and inflammation according to various metabolic syndrome definitions. *J Cardiometab Syndr*. 2009;4(1):33–39.
50. Tison GH, Blaha MJ, Budoff MJ, et al. The relationship of insulin resistance and extracoronary calcification in the multi-ethnic study of atherosclerosis. *Atherosclerosis*. 2011;218(2):507–510.
51. Capoulade R, Clavel MA, Dumesnil JG, et al. Impact of metabolic syndrome on progression of aortic stenosis: influence of age and statin therapy. *J Am Coll Cardiol*. 2012;60(3):216–223.
52. Blaha MJ, DeFilippis AP, Rivera JJ, et al. The relationship between insulin resistance and incidence and progression of coronary artery calcification: the Multi-Ethnic Study of Atherosclerosis (MESA). *Diabetes Care*. 2011;34(3):749–751.
53. Jensky NE, Criqui MH, Wright CM, Wassel CL, Alcaraz JE, Allison MA. The association between abdominal body composition and vascular calcification. *Obesity (Silver Spring)*. 2011;19(12):2418–2424.
54. Bremer AA, Devaraj S, Jialal I. Adipose tissue dysregulation in patients with metabolic syndrome. *J Clin Endocrinol Metab*. 2011;96(11):E1782–E1788.
55. Maahs DM, Ogden LG, Kinney GL, et al. Low plasma adiponectin levels predict progression of coronary artery calcification. *Circulation*. 2005;111(6):747–753.
56. Luo XH, Zhao LL, Yuan LQ, Wang M, Xie H, Liao EY. Development of arterial calcification in adiponectin-deficient mice: adiponectin regulates arterial calcification. *J Bone Miner Res*. 2009;24(8):1461–1468.
57. Son BK, Akishita M, Iijima K, et al. Adiponectin antagonizes stimulatory effect of tumor necrosis factor-alpha on vascular smooth muscle cell calcification: regulation of growth arrest-specific gene 6-mediated survival pathway by adenosine 5'-monophosphate-activated protein kinase. *Endocrinology*. 2008;149(4):1646–1653.
58. Qasim A, Mehta NN, Tadesse MG, et al. Adipokines, insulin resistance, and coronary artery calcification. *J Am Coll Cardiol*. 2008;52(3):231–236.
59. Reilly MP, Iqbal N, Schutta M, et al. Plasma leptin levels are associated with coronary atherosclerosis in type 2 diabetes. *J Clin Endocrinol Metab*. 2004;89(8):3872–3878.
60. Zeadin M, Butcher M, Werstuck G, Khan M, Yee CK, Shaughnessy SG. Effect of leptin on vascular calcification in apolipoprotein E-deficient mice. *Arterioscler Thromb Vasc Biol*. 2009;29(12):2069–2075.
61. Parhami F, Tintut Y, Ballard A, Fogelman AM, Demer LL. Leptin enhances the calcification of vascular cells: artery wall as a target of leptin. *Circ Res*. 2001;88(9):954–960.
62. Zeadin MG, Butcher MK, Shaughnessy SG, Werstuck GH. Leptin promotes osteoblast differentiation and mineralization of primary cultures of vascular smooth muscle cells by inhibiting glycogen synthase kinase (GSK)-3beta. *Biochem Biophys Res Commun*. 2012;425(4):924–930.
63. Fitch K, Abbara S, Lee H, et al. Effects of lifestyle modification and metformin on atherosclerotic indices among HIV-infected patients with the metabolic syndrome. *AIDS*. 2012;26(5):587–597.
64. Liu H, Lu Q, Huang K. Selenium suppressed hydrogen peroxide-induced vascular smooth muscle cells calcification through inhibiting oxidative stress and ERK activation. *J Cell Biochem*. 2010;111(6):1556–1564.
65. Guilgen G, Werneck ML, de Noronha L, et al. Increased calcification and protein nitration in arteries of chronic kidney disease patients. *Blood Purif*. 2011;32(4):296–302.
66. Liberman M, Bassi E, Martinatti MK, et al. Oxidant generation predominates around calcifying foci and enhances progression of aortic valve calcification. *Arterioscler Thromb Vasc Biol*. 2008;28(3):463–470.

67. Miller JD, Chu Y, Brooks RM, Richenbacher WE, Pena-Silva R, Heistad DD. Dysregulation of antioxidant mechanisms contributes to increased oxidative stress in calcific aortic valvular stenosis in humans. *J Am Coll Cardiol*. 2008;52(10):843–850.
68. Towler DA. Inorganic pyrophosphate: a paracrine regulator of vascular calcification and smooth muscle phenotype. *Arterioscler Thromb Vasc Biol*. 2005;25(4):651–654.
69. Li L, Mamputu JC, Wiernsperger N, Renier G. Signaling pathways involved in human vascular smooth muscle cell proliferation and matrix metalloproteinase-2 expression induced by leptin: inhibitory effect of metformin. *Diabetes*. 2005;54(7):2227–2234.
70. Schroeter MR, Leifheit-Nestler M, Hubert A, et al. Leptin promotes neointima formation and smooth muscle cell proliferation via NADPH oxidase activation and signalling in caveolin-rich microdomains. *Cardiovasc Res*. 2013;99(3):555–565.
71. Jiang F, Lim HK, Morris MJ, et al. Systemic upregulation of NADPH oxidase in diet-induced obesity in rats. *Redox Rep*. 2011;16(6):223–229.
72. Lanone S, Bloc S, Foresti R, et al. Bilirubin decreases nos2 expression via inhibition of NAD(P)H oxidase: implications for protection against endotoxic shock in rats. *FASEB J*. 2005;19(13):1890–1892.
73. Matsumoto H, Ishikawa K, Itabe H, Maruyama Y. Carbon monoxide and bilirubin from heme oxygenase-1 suppresses reactive oxygen species generation and plasminogen activator inhibitor-1 induction. *Mol Cell Biochem*. 2006;291(1–2):21–28.
74. Jiang F, Roberts SJ, Datla S, Dusting GJ. NO modulates NADPH oxidase function via heme oxygenase-1 in human endothelial cells. *Hypertension*. 2006;48(5):950–957.
75. Datla SR, Dusting GJ, Mori TA, Taylor CJ, Croft KD, Jiang F. Induction of heme oxygenase-1 in vivo suppresses NADPH oxidase derived oxidative stress. *Hypertension*. 2007;50(4):636–642.
76. Zhang ZY, Bian LQ, Kim SJ, Zhou CC, Choi YH. Inverse relation of total serum bilirubin to coronary artery calcification score detected by multidetector computed tomography in males. *Clin Cardiol*. 2012;35(5):301–306.
77. Lin TH, Tang CH, Hung SY, et al. Upregulation of heme oxygenase-1 inhibits the maturation and mineralization of osteoblasts. *J Cell Physiol*. 2010;222(3):757–768.
78. Zhang B, Tang C, Du J. Changes of heme oxygenase-carbon monoxide system in vascular calcification in rats. *Life Sci*. 2003;72(9):1027–1037.
79. Jiang CQ, Lao XQ, Yin P, et al. Smoking, smoking cessation and aortic arch calcification in older Chinese: the Guangzhou Biobank Cohort Study. *Atherosclerosis*. 2009;202(2):529–534.
80. Lambrechtsen J, Gerke O, Egstrup K, et al. The relation between coronary artery calcification in asymptomatic subjects and both traditional risk factors and living in the city centre: a DanRisk substudy. *J Intern Med*. 2012;271(5):444–450.
81. Hirooka N, Kadowaki T, Sekikawa A, et al. Influence of cigarette smoking on coronary artery and aortic calcium among random samples from populations of middle-aged Japanese and Korean men. *J Epidemiol Community Health*. 2013;67(2):119–124.
82. Jaimes EA, DeMaster EG, Tian RX, Raji L. Stable compounds of cigarette smoke induce endothelial superoxide anion production via NADPH oxidase activation. *Arterioscler Thromb Vasc Biol*. 2004;24(6):1031–1036.
83. Orosz Z, Csiszar A, Labinsky N, et al. Cigarette smoke-induced proinflammatory alterations in the endothelial phenotype: role of NAD(P)H oxidase activation. *Am J Physiol Heart Circ Physiol*. 2007;292(1):H130–H139.
84. Shih RH, Cheng SE, Hsiao LD, Kou YR, Yang CM. Cigarette smoke extract upregulates heme oxygenase-1 via PKC/NADPH oxidase/ROS/PDGFR/PI3K/Akt pathway in mouse brain endothelial cells. *J Neuroinflammation*. 2011;8:104.
85. Cheng SE, Lee IT, Lin CC, Kou YR, Yang CM. Cigarette smoke particle-phase extract induces HO-1 expression in human tracheal smooth muscle cells: role of the c-Src/NADPH oxidase/MAPK/Nrf2 signaling pathway. *Free Radic Biol Med*. 2010;48(10):1410–1422.
86. Talbot S, Lin JC, Lahjouji K, et al. Cigarette smoke-induced kinin B1 receptor promotes NADPH oxidase activity in cultured human alveolar epithelial cells. *Peptides*. 2011;32(7):1447–1456.
87. Asano H, Horinouchi T, Mai Y, et al. Nicotine- and tar-free cigarette smoke induces cell damage through reactive oxygen species newly generated by PKC-dependent activation of NADPH oxidase. *J Pharmacol Sci*. 2012;118(2):275–287.
88. Li X, Yang HY, Giachelli CM. Role of the sodium-dependent phosphate cotransporter, Pit-1, in vascular smooth muscle cell calcification. *Circ Res*. 2006;98(7):905–912.
89. Villa-Bellosta R, Bogaert YE, Levi M, Sorribas V. Characterization of phosphate transport in rat vascular smooth muscle cells: implications for vascular calcification. *Arterioscler Thromb Vasc Biol*. 2007;27(5):1030–1036.
90. Zhao MM, Xu MJ, Cai Y, et al. Mitochondrial reactive oxygen species promote p65 nuclear translocation mediating high-phosphate-induced vascular calcification in vitro and in vivo. *Kidney Int*. 2011;79(10):1071–1079.
91. Sutra T, Morena M, Bargnoux AS, Caporiccio B, Canaud B, Cristol JP. Superoxide production: a procalcifying cell signalling event in osteoblastic differentiation of vascular smooth muscle cells exposed to calcification media. *Free Radic Res*. 2008;42(9):789–797.
92. Kim H, Kim HJ, Lee K, et al. alpha-Lipoic acid attenuates vascular calcification via reversal of mitochondrial function and restoration of Gas6/Axl/Akt survival pathway. *J Cell Mol Med*. 2012;16(2):273–286.
93. Proudfoot D, Skepper JN, Hegyi L, Bennett MR, Shanahan CM, Weissberg PL. Apoptosis regulates human vascular calcification in vitro: evidence for initiation of vascular calcification by apoptotic bodies. *Circ Res*. 2000;87(11):1055–1062.
94. Kircelli F, Peter ME, Sevinc OE, et al. Magnesium reduces calcification in bovine vascular smooth muscle cells in a dose-dependent manner. *Nephrol Dial Transplant*. 2012;27(2):514–521.
95. Louvet L, Buchel J, Stepan S, Passlick-Deetjen J, Massy ZA. Magnesium prevents phosphate-induced calcification in human aortic vascular smooth muscle cells. *Nephrol Dial Transplant*. 2013;28(4):869–878.
96. Meema HE, Oreopoulos DG, Rapoport A. Serum magnesium level and arterial calcification in end-stage renal disease. *Kidney Int*. 1987;32(3):388–394.
97. Wei M, Esbaei K, Bargman J, Oreopoulos DG. Relationship between serum magnesium, parathyroid hormone, and vascular calcification in patients on dialysis: a literature review. *Perit Dial Int*. 2006;26(3):366–373.
98. Ishimura E, Okuno S, Kitatani K, et al. Significant association between the presence of peripheral vascular calcification and lower serum magnesium in hemodialysis patients. *Clin Nephrol*. 2007;68(4):222–227.
99. Turgut F, Kanbay M, Metin MR, Uz E, Akcay A, Covic A. Magnesium supplementation helps to improve carotid intima media thickness in patients on hemodialysis. *Int Urol Nephrol*. 2008;40(4):1075–1082.
100. Zheng J, Inoguchi T, Sasaki S, et al. Phycocyanin and phycocyanobilin from *Spirulina platensis* protect against diabetic nephropathy by inhibiting oxidative stress. *Am J Physiol Regul Integr Comp Physiol*. 2013;304(2):R110–R120.
101. McCarty MF. Clinical potential of *Spirulina* as a source of phycocyanobilin. *J Med Food*. 2007;10(4):566–570.
102. Romay C, Gonzalez R, Ledon N, Ramirez D, Rimbau V. C-phycocyanin: a biliprotein with antioxidant, anti-inflammatory and neuroprotective effects. *Curr Protein Pept Sci*. 2003;4(3):207–216.
103. Riss J, Decorde K, Sutra T, et al. Phycobiliprotein C-Phycocyanin from *Spirulina platensis* is powerfully responsible for reducing oxidative stress and NADPH oxidase expression induced by an atherogenic diet in hamsters. *J Agric Food Chem*. 2007;55(19):7962–7967.
104. Atkuri KR, Mantovani JJ, Herzenberg LA, Herzenberg LA. N-Acetylcysteine—a safe antidote for cysteine/glutathione deficiency. *Curr Opin Pharmacol*. 2007;7(4):355–359.

105. Dodd S, Dean O, Copolov DL, Malhi GS, Berk M. N-acetylcysteine for antioxidant therapy: pharmacology and clinical utility. *Expert Opin Biol Ther.* 2008;8(12):1955–1962.
106. Tepel M, van der Giet M, Statz M, Jankowski J, Zidek W. The antioxidant acetylcysteine reduces cardiovascular events in patients with end-stage renal failure: a randomized, controlled trial. *Circulation.* 2003;107(7):992–995.
107. Flier J, Van Muiswinkel FL, Jongenelen CA, Drukarch B. The neuroprotective antioxidant alpha-lipoic acid induces detoxication enzymes in cultured astroglial cells. *Free Radic Res.* 2002;36(6):695–699.
108. Cao Z, Tsang M, Zhao H, Li Y. Induction of endogenous antioxidants and phase 2 enzymes by alpha-lipoic acid in rat cardiac H9C2 cells: protection against oxidative injury. *Biochem Biophys Res Commun.* 2003;310(3):979–985.
109. Jia Z, Hallur S, Zhu H, Li Y, Misra HP. Potent upregulation of glutathione and NAD(P)H:quinone oxidoreductase 1 by alpha-lipoic acid in human neuroblastoma SH-SY5Y cells: protection against neurotoxicant-elicited cytotoxicity. *Neurochem Res.* 2008;33(5):790–800.
110. Wenzel P, Hink U, Oelze M, et al. Role of reduced lipoic acid in the redox regulation of mitochondrial aldehyde dehydrogenase (ALDH-2) activity. Implications for mitochondrial oxidative stress and nitrate tolerance. *J Biol Chem.* 2007;282(1):792–799.
111. He L, Liu B, Dai Z, et al. Alpha lipoic acid protects heart against myocardial ischemia-reperfusion injury through a mechanism involving aldehyde dehydrogenase 2 activation. *Eur J Pharmacol.* 2012;678(1–3):32–38.
112. Surh YJ, Kundu JK, Na HK. Nrf2 as a master redox switch in turning on the cellular signaling involved in the induction of cytoprotective genes by some chemopreventive phytochemicals. *Planta Med.* 2008;74(13):1526–1539.
113. Steinbrenner H, Sies H. Protection against reactive oxygen species by selenoproteins. *Biochim Biophys Acta.* 2009;1790(11):1478–1485.
114. Tanguy S, Grauzam S, de LJ, Boucher F. Impact of dietary selenium intake on cardiac health: experimental approaches and human studies. *Mol Nutr Food Res.* 2012;56(7):1106–1121.
115. Robin E, Guzy RD, Loor G, et al. Oxidant stress during simulated ischemia primes cardiomyocytes for cell death during reperfusion. *J Biol Chem.* 2007;282(26):19133–19143.
116. Pashkow FJ, Watumull DG, Campbell CL. Astaxanthin: a novel potential treatment for oxidative stress and inflammation in cardiovascular disease. *Am J Cardiol.* 2008;101(10A):58D–68D.
117. Lauer DA, Lockwood SF, Lucchesi BR. Disodium disuccinate astaxanthin (Cardax) attenuates complement activation and reduces myocardial injury following ischemia/reperfusion. *J Pharmacol Exp Ther.* 2005;314(2):686–692.
118. Wolf AM, Asoh S, Hiranuma H, et al. Astaxanthin protects mitochondrial redox state and functional integrity against oxidative stress. *J Nutr Biochem.* 2010;21(5):381–389.
119. Verhaar MC, Wever RM, Kastelein JJ, van Dam T, Koomans HA, Rabelink TJ. 5-methyltetrahydrofolate, the active form of folic acid, restores endothelial function in familial hypercholesterolemia. *Circulation.* 1998;97(3):237–241.
120. Rezk BM, Haenen GR, Van der Vijgh WJ, Bast A. Tetrahydrofolate and 5-methyltetrahydrofolate are folates with high antioxidant activity. Identification of the antioxidant pharmacophore. *FEBS Lett.* 2003;555(3):601–605.
121. Antoniadou C, Shirodaria C, Warrick N, et al. 5-methyltetrahydrofolate rapidly improves endothelial function and decreases superoxide production in human vessels: effects on vascular tetrahydrobiopterin availability and endothelial nitric oxide synthase coupling. *Circulation.* 2006;114(11):1193–1201.
122. Tawakol A, Migrino RQ, Aziz KS, et al. High-dose folic acid acutely improves coronary vasodilator function in patients with coronary artery disease. *J Am Coll Cardiol.* 2005;45(10):1580–1584.
123. Moens AL, Claeys MJ, Wuyts FL, et al. Effect of folic acid on endothelial function following acute myocardial infarction. *Am J Cardiol.* 2007;99(4):476–481.
124. McCarty MF, Barroso-Aranda J, Contreras F. High-dose folate and dietary purines promote scavenging of peroxynitrite-derived radicals—clinical potential in inflammatory disorders. *Med Hypotheses.* 2009;73(5):824–834.
125. Kietadisorn R, Schmidt HH, Moens AL. Folic acid as a cardiovascular drug: dose matters. *Am J Cardiol.* 2010;106(11):1673–1674.
126. McCarty MF. Oster rediscovered—mega-dose folate for symptomatic atherosclerosis. *Med Hypotheses.* 2007;69(2):325–332.
127. Myung SK, Ju W, Cho B, et al. Efficacy of vitamin and antioxidant supplements in prevention of cardiovascular disease: systematic review and meta-analysis of randomised controlled trials. *BMJ.* 2013;346:f10.
128. Spiegel DM, Farmer B, Smits G, Chonchol M. Magnesium carbonate is an effective phosphate binder for chronic hemodialysis patients: a pilot study. *J Ren Nutr.* 2007;17(6):416–422.
129. De Schutter TM, Behets GJ, Geryl H, et al. Effect of a magnesium-based phosphate binder on medial calcification in a rat model of uremia. *Kidney Int.* 2013;83(6):1109–1117.
130. McCarty MF. A moderately low phosphate intake may provide health benefits analogous to those conferred by UV light—a further advantage of vegan diets. *Med Hypotheses.* 2003;61(5–6):543–560.
131. Ferro CJ, Chue CD, Steeds RP, Townend JN. Is lowering phosphate exposure the key to preventing arterial stiffening with age? *Heart.* 2009;95(21):1770–1772.
132. Calvo MS, Uribarri J. Public health impact of dietary phosphorus excess on bone and cardiovascular health in the general population. *Am J Clin Nutr.* 2013;98(1):6–15.
133. Gutierrez OM. Sodium- and phosphorus-based food additives: persistent but surmountable hurdles in the management of nutrition in chronic kidney disease. *Adv Chronic Kidney Dis.* 2013;20(2):150–156.
134. Shantouf R, Ahmadi N, Flores F, et al. Impact of phosphate binder type on coronary artery calcification in hemodialysis patients. *Clin Nephrol.* 2010;74(1):12–18.
135. Navaneethan SD, Palmer SC, Craig JC, Elder GJ, Strippoli GF. Benefits and harms of phosphate binders in CKD: a systematic review of randomized controlled trials. *Am J Kidney Dis.* 2009;54(4):619–637.
136. Jamal SA, Fitchett D, Lok CE, Mendelssohn DC, Tsuyuki RT. The effects of calcium-based versus non-calcium-based phosphate binders on mortality among patients with chronic kidney disease: a meta-analysis. *Nephrol Dial Transplant.* 2009;24(10):3168–3174.
137. Rennick A, Kalakeche R, Seel L, Shepler B. Nicotinic Acid and nicotinamide: a review of their use for hyperphosphatemia in dialysis patients. *Pharmacotherapy.* 2013;33(6):683–690.
138. Maccubbin D, Tipping D, Kuznetsova O, Hanlon WA, Bostom AG. Hypophosphatemic effect of niacin in patients without renal failure: a randomized trial. *Clin J Am Soc Nephrol.* 2010;5(4):582–589.
139. Hu S, Shearer GC, Steffes MW, Harris WS, Bostom AG. Once-daily extended-release niacin lowers serum phosphorus concentrations in patients with metabolic syndrome dyslipidemia. *Am J Kidney Dis.* 2011;57(1):181–182.
140. McCarty MF, DiNicolantonio JJ. Bioavailable dietary phosphate is emerging as mediator of cardiovascular disease, and may be decreased with plant-based diets, phosphate binders, niacin, and avoidance of phosphate additives. *Nutrition.* 2014; accepted for publication.
141. Schurgers LJ, Cranenburg EC, Vermeer C. Matrix Gla-protein: the calcification inhibitor in need of vitamin K. *Thromb Haemost.* 2008;100(4):593–603.
142. Schurgers LJ, Uitto J, Reutelingsperger CP. Vitamin K-dependent carboxylation of matrix Gla-protein: a crucial switch to control ectopic mineralization. *Trends Mol Med.* 2013;19(4):217–226.
143. Lerner RG, Aronow WS, Sekhri A, et al. Warfarin use and the risk of valvular calcification. *J Thromb Haemost.* 2009;7(12):2023–2027.
144. Bostrom K, Tsao D, Shen S, Wang Y, Demer LL. Matrix GLA protein modulates differentiation induced by bone morphogenetic protein-2 in C3H10T1/2 cells. *J Biol Chem.* 2001;276(17):14044–14052.
145. Wallin R, Cain D, Hutson SM, Sane DC, Loeser R. Modulation of the binding of matrix Gla protein (MGP) to bone morphogenetic protein-2 (BMP-2). *Thromb Haemost.* 2000;84(6):1039–1044.

146. Yao Y, Shahbazian A, Bostrom KI. Proline and gamma-carboxylated glutamate residues in matrix Gla protein are critical for binding of bone morphogenetic protein-4. *Circ Res*. 2008;102(9):1065–1074.
147. Schurgers LJ, Barreto DV, Barreto FC, et al. The circulating inactive form of matrix gla protein is a surrogate marker for vascular calcification in chronic kidney disease: a preliminary report. *Clin J Am Soc Nephrol*. 2010;5(4):568–575.
148. Dalmeijer GW, van der Schouw YT, Vermeer C, Magdeleyns EJ, Schurgers LJ, Beulens JW. Circulating matrix Gla protein is associated with coronary artery calcification and vitamin K status in healthy women. *J Nutr Biochem*. 2013;24(4):624–628.
149. Dalmeijer GW, van der Schouw YT, Magdeleyns E, Ahmed N, Vermeer C, Beulens JW. The effect of menaquinone-7 supplementation on circulating species of matrix Gla protein. *Atherosclerosis*. 2012;225(2):397–402.
150. Westenfeld R, Krueger T, Schlieper G, et al. Effect of vitamin K2 supplementation on functional vitamin K deficiency in hemodialysis patients: a randomized trial. *Am J Kidney Dis*. 2012;59(2):186–195.
151. Vermeer C. Vitamin K: the effect on health beyond coagulation—an overview. *Food Nutr Res*. 2012;56. doi:10.3402/fnr.v56i0.5329.
152. Beulens JW, Bots ML, Atsma F, et al. High dietary menaquinone intake is associated with reduced coronary calcification. *Atherosclerosis*. 2009;203(2):489–493.
153. Geleijnse JM, Vermeer C, Grobbee DE, et al. Dietary intake of menaquinone is associated with a reduced risk of coronary heart disease: the Rotterdam Study. *J Nutr*. 2004;134(11):3100–3105.
154. Gast GC, de Roos NM, Sluijs I, et al. A high menaquinone intake reduces the incidence of coronary heart disease. *Nutr Metab Cardiovasc Dis*. 2009;19(7):504–510.
155. Kaneki M, Hodges SJ, Hosoi T, et al. Japanese fermented soybean food as the major determinant of the large geographic difference in circulating levels of vitamin K2: possible implications for hip-fracture risk. *Nutrition*. 2001;17(4):315–321.
156. Cockayne S, Adamson J, Lanham-New S, Shearer MJ, Gilbody S, Torgerson DJ. Vitamin K and the prevention of fractures: systematic review and meta-analysis of randomized controlled trials. *Arch Intern Med*. 2006;166(12):1256–1261.
157. Pilkey RM, Morton AR, Boffa MB, et al. Subclinical vitamin K deficiency in hemodialysis patients. *Am J Kidney Dis*. 2007;49(3):432–439.
158. Cranenburg EC, Schurgers LJ, Uiterwijk HH, et al. Vitamin K intake and status are low in hemodialysis patients. *Kidney Int*. 2012;82(5):605–610.
159. Garcia-Canton C, Bosch E, Ramirez A, et al. Vascular calcification and 25-hydroxyvitamin D levels in non-dialysis patients with chronic kidney disease stages 4 and 5. *Nephrol Dial Transplant*. 2011;26(7):2250–2256.
160. Zagura M, Serg M, Kampus P, et al. Aortic stiffness and vitamin D are independent markers of aortic calcification in patients with peripheral arterial disease and in healthy subjects. *Eur J Vasc Endovasc Surg*. 2011;42(5):689–695.
161. Lee SY, Kim HY, Gu SW, Kim HJ, Yang DH. 25-hydroxyvitamin D levels and vascular calcification in predialysis and dialysis patients with chronic kidney disease. *Kidney Blood Press Res*. 2012;35(5):349–354.
162. Naves-Diaz M, Cabezas-Rodriguez I, Barrio-Vazquez S, Fernandez E, Diaz-Lopez JB, Cannata-Andia JB. Low calcidiol levels and risk of progression of aortic calcification. *Osteoporos Int*. 2012;23(3):1177–1182.
163. Schmidt N, Brandsch C, Kuhne H, Thiele A, Hirche F, Stangl GI. Vitamin D receptor deficiency and low vitamin D diet stimulate aortic calcification and osteogenic key factor expression in mice. *PLoS ONE*. 2012;7(4):e35316.
164. Zittermann A, Koerfer R. Protective and toxic effects of vitamin D on vascular calcification: clinical implications. *Mol Aspects Med*. 2008;29(6):423–432.
165. Vieth R. The mechanisms of vitamin D toxicity. *Bone Miner*. 1990;11(3):267–272.
166. Zittermann A. Vitamin D and disease prevention with special reference to cardiovascular disease. *Prog Biophys Mol Biol*. 2006;92(1):39–48.
167. Peiris AN, Youssef D, Grant WB. Secondary hyperparathyroidism: benign bystander or culpable contributor to adverse health outcomes? *South Med J*. 2012;105(1):36–42.
168. Whitfield JF. Osteogenic PTHs and vascular ossification—Is there a danger for osteoporotics? *J Cell Biochem*. 2005;95(3):437–444.
169. Cheng SL, Shao JS, Halstead LR, Distelhorst K, Sierra O, Towler DA. Activation of vascular smooth muscle parathyroid hormone receptor inhibits Wnt/beta-catenin signaling and aortic fibrosis in diabetic arteriosclerosis. *Circ Res*. 2010;107(2):271–282.
170. Gracioli FG, Neves KR, dos Reis LM, et al. Phosphorus overload and PTH induce aortic expression of Runx2 in experimental uraemia. *Nephrol Dial Transplant*. 2009;24(5):1416–1421.
171. Somjen D, Weisman Y, Kohen F, et al. 25-hydroxyvitamin D3-1alpha-hydroxylase is expressed in human vascular smooth muscle cells and is upregulated by parathyroid hormone and estrogenic compounds. *Circulation*. 2005;111(13):1666–1671.
172. Aoshima Y, Mizobuchi M, Ogata H, et al. Vitamin D receptor activators inhibit vascular smooth muscle cell mineralization induced by phosphate and TNF-alpha. *Nephrol Dial Transplant*. 2012;27(5):1800–1806.
173. Jono S, Nishizawa Y, Shioi A, Morii H. 1,25-Dihydroxyvitamin D3 increases in vitro vascular calcification by modulating secretion of endogenous parathyroid hormone-related peptide. *Circulation*. 1998;98(13):1302–1306.
174. Wu-Wong JR, Noonan W, Ma J, et al. Role of phosphorus and vitamin D analogs in the pathogenesis of vascular calcification. *J Pharmacol Exp Ther*. 2006;318(1):90–98.
175. Guerrero F, Montes de OA, Aguilera-Tejero E, Zafra R, Rodriguez M, Lopez I. The effect of vitamin D derivatives on vascular calcification associated with inflammation. *Nephrol Dial Transplant*. 2012;27(6):2206–2212.
176. Vieth R. Vitamin D and cancer mini-symposium: the risk of additional vitamin D. *Ann Epidemiol*. 2009;19(7):441–445.
177. Jean G, Souberbielle JC, Chazot C. Monthly cholecalciferol administration in haemodialysis patients: a simple and efficient strategy for vitamin D supplementation. *Nephrol Dial Transplant*. 2009;24(12):3799–3805.
178. Kandula P, Dobre M, Schold JD, Schreiber MJ Jr, Mehrotra R, Navaneethan SD. Vitamin D supplementation in chronic kidney disease: a systematic review and meta-analysis of observational studies and randomized controlled trials. *Clin J Am Soc Nephrol*. 2011;6(1):50–62.
179. Teng M, Wolf M, Lowrie E, Ofsthun N, Lazarus JM, Thadhani R. Survival of patients undergoing hemodialysis with paricalcitol or calcitriol therapy. *N Engl J Med*. 2003;349(5):446–456.
180. Martinez-Moreno JM, Munoz-Castaneda JR, Herencia C, et al. In vascular smooth muscle cells paricalcitol prevents phosphate-induced Wnt/beta-catenin activation. *Am J Physiol Renal Physiol*. 2012;303(8):F1136–F1144.
181. Johnson K, Polewski M, van ED, Terkeltaub R. Chondrogenesis mediated by PPI depletion promotes spontaneous aortic calcification in NPP1^{-/-} mice. *Arterioscler Thromb Vasc Biol*. 2005;25(4):686–691.
182. Nitta K, Akiba T, Suzuki K, et al. Effects of cyclic intermittent etidronate therapy on coronary artery calcification in patients receiving long-term hemodialysis. *Am J Kidney Dis*. 2004;44(4):680–688.
183. Koshiyama H, Nakamura Y, Tanaka S, Minamikawa J. Decrease in carotid intima-media thickness after 1-year therapy with etidronate for osteopenia associated with type 2 diabetes. *J Clin Endocrinol Metab*. 2000;85(8):2793–2796.
184. Hashiba H, Aizawa S, Tamura K, Kogo H. Inhibition of the progression of aortic calcification by etidronate treatment in hemodialysis patients: long-term effects. *Ther Apher Dial*. 2006;10(1):59–64.
185. Tamura K, Suzuki Y, Matsushita M, et al. Prevention of aortic calcification by etidronate in the renal failure rat model. *Eur J Pharmacol*. 2007;558(1–3):159–166.